

Article

### Metaethical theory of folklore with Dede Korkut culture metaverse designs

#### Sacide Çobanoğlu

Independent Researcher, Ankara 06810, Turkey; sacidecobanoglu01@gmail.com

#### CITATION

Çobanoğlu S. Metaethical theory of folklore with Dede Korkut culture metaverse designs. Metaverse. 2025; 6(2): 3457. https://doi.org/10.54517/m3457

#### ARTICLE INFO

Received: 17 March 2025 Accepted: 14 April 2025 Available online: 25 April 2025

#### **COPYRIGHT**



Copyright © 2025 by author(s). Metaverse is published by Asia Pacific Academy of Science Pte. Ltd. This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license.

https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/

Abstract: We can define the period we are living in as the last step of Society 5.0 (Super Intelligent Society) dominated by unmanned technologies and the first step of Society 6.0 Ecological Revolution Super Information Society. In the last step of 5.0, the new online lifestyle with the Internet of Things, interfaces, big data, robotics stages, the Digital Big Bang: Metaverse! takes place in our lives day by day. Today, humanity is faced with many problems that disrupt the ecological balance such as climate change, environmental pollution, radioactive pollution, industrial wastes, unplanned urbanization, which can be described as negative actions that lay the foundations of the Society 6.0 Ecological Revolution Super Information Society. Undoubtedly, one of the most important of these problems is the negative change in our understanding of ethics. There is an active role for science in the development of digital technologies, but there is also a need for an active role for social sciences in determining the cultural, sociological and psychological effects of technologies on individuals. With the Culture Metaverse to be established in the new digital life metaverse, it is possible to remind people of the ethical values that humanity has forgotten, to determine the ethical rules to be followed in the universes where humanity will pass with prototype avatars, in the colorful lives they will lead, in brand new experiences, and to create a digital ethical plane. The definition, content and function of culture within the research area of folklore discipline; cultural drilling, comparing different cultures, analysis and synthesis. In this respect, in this new digital structuring where the cultural ergonomics process will be experienced, designing a metaverse with cultural content is within the research areas of folklore discipline and folklorists. For this reason, there will be a great need for Turkish folklorists in the trained staff who will structure the Turkish Culture Metaverse. In this study, the concept of Digital Big Bang: Metaverse! The concept is examined with the synthesis of science and social sciences with the Folkloric Metaethical Theory, which I put forward with interdisciplinarity in the fields of folklore and metaethics, and the method of analysis of my theory, the Folkloric Grounding Metaethical Analysis Method. The positive/negative effects of the concept of metaverse (beyond the universe) were investigated. Based on the universal ethical philosophy of the Book of Dede Korkut, the culture metaverse was designed and the name "metaethicalverse", which I gave to the ethical understanding of the culture metaverse, was exemplified by how to define the designed metaverse with the ethical code of Dede Korkut. Different concepts and designs of the Dede Korkut Culture Metaverse are presented. Our study, as the first study to examine the metaverse from a folkloric perspective, aims to address the disciplines of folklore and ethics at the metaethical level and to adapt them to digital universes, to interpret Dede Korkut's ethical philosophy with a universal perspective and to reconstruct it in the metaverse environment, and to draw attention to the new goals to be achieved by folklorists who will undertake the role of the quarterback of the digital age.

**Keywords:** Metaethical Theory of Folklore; Metaethicalverse; Culture Metaverse; Dede Korkut Book; Dede Korkut ethical code

#### 1. Introduction

The infrastructure of the technology that humanity has reached today is based on

the dreams of the earliest mythological periods. Human curiosity, the urge to learn and the desire to dominate the universe, separated from all living creatures in the universe with the ability to think, have enabled him to develop and progress. For example, in the Iliad, Homer mentions chairs called "tripods" that move on their own. To move these chairs around, Hephaestus, the Blacksmith God, created attendants. The attendants are called "golden attendants". Another example comes from Aristotle's imagination: "Imagine that every tool in our hands performs its own work, either at our command or in case of need; if, like the tripods of Hephaistos, which the bard says 'move on their own and enter the assembly of the gods', the shuttle of the loom moves by itself and the plectrum of the lyre plays by itself, then neither master craftsmen need servants nor masters need slaves", he says, referring to an as yet unnamed creation with the ability to move on its own [1] (p. 19).

In the introduction to Leviathan, Thomas Hobbes surprisingly states: "If we consider life as consisting in the motion of certain limbs, and if we admit that it is due to an essential part in us, why should we not say that all automata are motors, like clocks, moving of themselves by means of springs and wheels, and that all automata have an artificial life? In that case, instead of a heart, there are springs; instead of nerves, there are strings; instead of joints, there are wheels that move the body..." [2] (p. 17). Leonardo Da Vinci drew a robot design in the form of a knight in 1495 with magnificent creativity.

As humanity has progressed through the history of civilization, it has gained experience and knowledge by experiencing a different form of society in each period, and has reached the present day by overthrowing the ages. Homer's tripods and golden companions, Aristotle's and Hobbes' self-propelled tools, 3D software and artificial intelligence have been transformed into 3D software and artificial intelligence, and the role of being their golden companion has been assigned to humanity. The Homo sapiens species no longer wants to be condemned to live on a single planet and wants to reach new planets. With the urge to be immortal since Gilgamesh, it has created a digital world with the knowledge it has accumulated in all stages of society, and created this world with the slogan "Big Bang: Metaverse!" and announced it to the world with the slogan. Thus, today's Homo sapiens species has succeeded in reaching the new universes it imagines through virtual means. Just like the cell phone, the metaverse will enter our lives in a short time and become an integral part of it, and the whole world is striving to be a part of this formation in these days when online life has just begun. The promises of the metaverse to humanity are a more livable world and a sustainable high quality of life [3] (p. 2).

Today, the world is faced with many ethical problems as a result of the technology we have accessed. In the new process of change/transformation that will begin with the metaverse online lifestyle, it seems inevitable that new ones will be added to the already existing ethical problems. I call a metaverse designed based on a nation's ancient traditions, oral and written history, mythology, epics, tales and past experiences a "cultural metaverse". Establishing a cultural metaverse and reminding humanity of forgotten ethical values through these metaverses can be one of the solutions to ethical problems in the process of change/transformation. There is a need for the studies of science for the development of digital technologies in metaverse structures, and the studies of social sciences to determine the cultural, sociological and

psychological effects of digital technologies on individuals and to minimize the negativities of these effects. Within the scope of folklore discipline; definition of culture, content, function, cultural drilling, comparing different cultures, analysis and synthesis. In this new digital structuring in which the whole world will experience a process of adaptation to cultural ergonomics; designing universes with cultural content and creating cultural connections between universes and realizing them are within the research areas of folklore discipline and folklorists.

Based on these thoughts, in this study, the concept of Metaverse, which is the last point of the long road that has been traveled in both science and social sciences from the distant past of civilization to the present day, has been examined with the Metaethical theory of folklore that I have put forward with interdisciplinarity in the fields of folklore and metaethics and the examination method of the theory, the Folkloric Grounding Metaethical Analysis Method. Based on the universal ethical philosophy in the Book of Dede Korkut, one of the most important works of Turkish culture, I turned this philosophy into an ethical code that I call "the Dede Korkut ethical code". This ethical code constitutes the essence of "the metaethicsverse", the name I give to the ethical plane and ethical understanding of the metaverse. In my study, the positive/negative effects of the metaverse concept were investigated with the synthesis of science and social sciences. It was tried to point out the metaverse professions of folklorists and the important mission they will undertake in the future, and the possible effects of the brand-new phenomenon metaverse were investigated and discussed in this context designed for the Turkish Culture Metaverse. My study draws attention to the great need for Turkish folklorists and new goals in the educated staff that will structure the Turkish Culture Metaverse.

### 1.1. What is the metaverse?

The word metaverse is derived by combining the Greek prefix *meta*, meaning after, and the English word "universe", meaning universe. It means beyond the universe [4]. Metaverse, which is a collective sharing space and a fictional universe created by combining different virtual worlds, is more than a word, it is a concept. For now, entry to the metaverse is provided by VR glasses that users wear on their heads. However, in a short time, it is aimed to enter the metaverse through lenses and sensory-transmitting clothes connected to the nervous system. Users move through the metaverse with an avatar they freely choose for themselves. They choose the universes they want to visit according to their interests and engage in activities there.

Accordingly, we can define the metaverse as follows: It is a cyber-social plane where advanced technologies are used simultaneously, differences such as race, gender, physical disability lose their importance, and users can experience different universes with their avatars. Both cultural and economic production can take place in the metaverse. In addition to shopping, trade, education, friend meetings, business meetings, concerts, family visits, games in daily life, all activities in the fields of religion, mysticism, metaphysics, new age can be carried to the metaverse and realized through avatars in this digital environment. In this sense, the metaverse is an online lifestyle that enables all kinds of activities to be carried out in an alternative virtual life [3] (p. 5).

The word metaverse was first used by Stephenson [5] in his science fiction novel "Snow Crash". The metaverse was introduced to the world by its owner Mark Zuckerberg [6] at the "Facebook Connect 2021" meeting, thus making Stephenson's dream of multiple universes in his novel a reality today. Following the introduction of the metaverse, major companies such as Microsoft and Google designed their own metaverse [7], and many states established consortia for their national metaverse. The fastest mover among these states is South Korea, which has defined its capital, Seoul as a metaverse [8] (p. 232–237). Famous companies such as Nike and Adidas have also purchased virtual plots on metaverse platforms and prepared digital content in accordance with the metaverse theory [9]. The metaverse is a brand-new phenomenon that has entered our lives in the form of the 5.0 society we are living in. It is seen that everything created in all science fiction novels and movies comes true one day. This is a reality we have been living since the novels of "Jules Verne." After the novel Snow Crash, in which the metaverse was first discussed, we see that the same process has been experienced, as a matter of fact, the metaverse has been the subject of many novels and movies. "Ready Player One, Avatar, Gattaca, Otherland, Altered Carbon, Surrogates, Never Let Me Go, Dune, The Eyes of Zahra, Lucy," "The Matrix" can be counted among the movies in which the metaverse is the subject. All this activity has brought a huge increase in the sale of cryptocurrencies related to the metaverse. Companies such as Apple, Google, Microsoft, Roblox, Tiktok, Nvidia, Epic Games; brands such as Coca Cola, Visa, Burberry, Gucci are among the leading companies investing heavily in the metaverse, while companies such as Decentraland, The Sandbox create virtual universes where cryptocurrencies and encryption technology are used and open them for use at a great speed. Land for sale in the metaverse is in great demand by people. Big companies such as Epic Games, Microsoft, Meta (Facebook), SK Telecoma are building metaverse worlds with Visa NFT (Non-Fungible Token) products and investments, as well as famous clothing brands such as Louis Vuitton, Dolce & Gabbana, Channel, Burberry, Gucci, Zara, H&M, Adidas announcing the opening of stores on metaverse platforms. Nike, which is present in the world markets with the slogan Just do it! has acquired a metaverse company producing NFT shoes and announced that it will use the slogan "I walk without shoes, but my avatar never! as its virtual world slogan. Adidas, Bored Ape Yacht Club Punks Comic and Gmoney" came together to step into the metaverse and announced that they were launching an NFT series called "Into the Metaverse", which would allow NFT owners to purchase exclusive products at a discount. The platform has become a new market for luxury brands, creating a new consumption experience.

Keepface Platform, an automated influencer marketing platform connecting more than 500 k influencers and 5000+ brands in the metaverse, is already in motion. The Metafluence virtual city has been established in the Metaverse, bringing together leading influencers, their audiences and brands. Within Metafluence, influencers will have a digital residence called Metahut. Here they will be able to offer NFTs and share their lifestyles [9]. One of the most popular applications in the metaverse is buying land. After the news that the land of a 259-parcel virtual house was sold for 913 thousand dollars was announced on television channels, the demand for virtual land in the metaverse cannot be kept up.

The world is hopeful about the metaverse. According to a study conducted by

research firm Forrester in December 2021, nearly a third of online users are excited about the metaverse, and nearly 30% think the metaverse is a good thing for society. According to a study by US-based Citigroup, the metaverse is expected to become a \$13 trillion economy by 2030 and host 5 billion users. The current value of the metaverse is \$21 billion, but it is expected to reach \$800 billion in the next two years [10].

#### 1.2. Positive and negative aspects of the metaverse

Human beings are curious not only about what they have experienced in their own lives, but also about the experiences in the lives of others, and today we have the opportunity to experience this desire we have had since the past with a new technology, the metaverse technology. The metaverse offers humanity the opportunity to change its own race, language, religion, gender, physical deficiencies, and live dozens of lives that it may never even witness without changing its own life. In a way, this can be considered a very good opportunity. However, the psychological and sociological effects of these experiences will be profound when augmented reality and VR goggles allow people to experience experiences that they can only witness in two dimensions by listening or watching with infinite freedom. People may confuse their virtual lives in the metaverse with their real lives. After a while, they may exhibit schizophrenic symptoms. They may start to show the negative behaviors that they can perform in the virtual environment without any obligation in the real world.

No experience in the metaverse requires the same effort as in the real world. The human body can suffer from this because humans need to move. If they don't move, they can lose their organs, their limbs can stop working. Obesity problems start to occur. Even if the metaverse gives the freedom to move, people will choose the easy way and not move. As a matter of fact, we usually do not prefer the stairs when there is an elevator. In this way, in the virtual lifestyle of the metaverse, when the human body does not move, we will encounter people dying in front of the computer without realizing it, just as people who are pushed into loneliness for various psychological reasons today suffer from hoarding disease and create mountains of garbage in their homes. Because with sensory transmissions connected to their bodies, people will not be able to understand that they are hungry or thirsty, and they will not realize how many hours they have been in front of the computer. People may unwittingly fall into a situation that is the exact opposite of Plato's allegory of the cave. They may be caught between real life, which refers to the world of objects, and virtual life, which refers to the world of ideas. Although they physically belong to the world of objects, they may reject it and pursue their projections in the world of ideas. Contrary to the aim, instead of a universe where race, language, religion and gender problems do not occur, many negativities may occur in line with ideas such as racism and immigrant hostility as a result of avatars carrying their entire social, economic and social aspects to the metaverse. It is clear that human intelligence, which is dominated by artificial intelligence, faces dangers such as establishing cause-effect relationships, creatingdeveloping strategies, and losing cognitive skills [3] (p. 65).

Alongside all these negatives, the metaverse has many positive aspects. For example, it will provide a huge advantage in medicine and education. Medical

professionals who have difficulty in finding cadavers will no longer have difficulties because with 3D technology, you will be able to enter a vein with your own body, completely as you. You will be able to touch the vessel wall with your hands and examine the millions of tiny capillaries running through it. Engineers will be able to go under or on the bridges they design and touch them with their hands to change their designs, add to them, or subtract from them. There will be no need to go to language courses or to the country whose language you want to learn, and no need to spend money for this purpose. You will be able to go to the country whose language you want to learn, walk its streets, talk to its avatars and learn the language from where you sit. And you won't have to worry about food, shelter or security because the moment you take off your VR headset, you will still be in your safe home, in your cozy room, in front of your computer offering you colorful worlds. You will be able to go to the pyramids of Egypt, the Siberian shelf, the rainforest, the Tumbaktu desert and anywhere else you want. You will be able to create your own content in your metaverse and distribute it freely to the digital world. You will be able to see all the changes made and experience them in real time, as well as all the information you can access, all user avatars will be able to access it simultaneously with you. When shopping, you will be able to interact with them in 3D form and have face-to-face meetings with them instead of talking to the customer representative in writing on social media or asking questions to brands and waiting for a written answer. In this way, you will be able to participate in all the culture and art trips you want. Except for physical work, you will not have to go to the workplace and work, just like you did during Covid-19, you will be able to do this from your home, from your computer, but this time you will be in your office with your avatar, you will be able to do your job by touching, hearing and feeling.

A student in a corner of the world will be able to study at the world's best universities without leaving his or her place or spending any money. Students will also be able to experience their education through simulation. For example, instead of being told about a war in history class, they will be able to be in that war together, inside cells in biology class, inside the universe in science classes, and even walk on planets. You will be able to explore areas that you never knew you had a talent for because you never had the opportunity to experience them. Let's think for a moment, if the great musical genius Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart had been born in Matola, Mozambique instead of Salzburg, Austria; if his father had been a fisherman on an old boat instead of a violinist in the royal orchestra, would Mozart's genius have been discovered? As in this example, the metaverse paves the way for you to discover many of your talents that exist in you but that you have not discovered due to your place of birth, your lifestyle, your circumstances and many other reasons. When the powerful internet network is spread all over the world, with the democratic structure of technology, and with the provision of a sustainable education that can be delivered to everyone on equal terms, perhaps we can make Ibn Khaldun's saying "Geography is destiny!" a thing of the past. Perhaps the way to remedy this injustice lies in the proper use of the technology developed by humanity.

Here is the Digital Big Bang: The metaverse can shake beliefs and purposes, it can be the chaos that humanity will fall into, it can be the magnificent future that humanity will live in, or it can be a brand new way of life with a mixture of both...

These are the different outcomes of the metaverse that we will see in the coming years. The metaverse is the "for now" final point that humanity reached with the utopia of being on this planet and establishing a new life at a moment when it realized that it could not solve the problems of the planet it lived on, and when it calculated that it would take light-years to find another planet in the universe and establish a new life here. In the lives that humanity will establish in the metaverse, the answer to the question "What is the meaning of life?" will not be a common sentence for all humanity. It will be a sentence that changes according to everyone's own scale of meaning.

As humanity, we can only reach these conclusions by living. As has been the case throughout human history, necessary measures will be taken for the negativities experienced in this process. Inter-metaverse ethics agreements will be made and laws will be put in place. These laws will be put into practice with the buttons added to the system. The road will continue. This process is the process of moving the process that Jean-Jacques Rousseau summarized with the "social contract" of humanity's state-building and civilization-building stages from the early ages to the present day to the digital world.

### 1.3. Metaverse in the context of the expansions of findings in science in social sciences

Almost every technological development and theory in the sciences has an implication for the social sciences; almost every technological finding in the sciences has implications for the social sciences. All findings of the sciences have found a response in the social sciences. The metaverse online life, the digital big bang of our age, is one of the findings of science, but this finding will also have implications in the social sciences because the metaverse, which is still under development, falls within the research fields of both science and social sciences. It necessitates the two disciplines.

The roots of this dichotomy between science and social sciences today go back to the 17th century. In the 17th century, only the natural sciences were of interest, and it was believed that this was the way to reach certain and true knowledge. Descartes was one of the leading proponents of this view. Descartes claimed that history could not be a discipline of knowledge. On the other hand, Giambattista Vico (1668-1744) the dominance of Descartes' method in the sciences, saying that the Cartesians exaggerated the role of physical and mathematical sciences and ignored the knowledge of history and society. He defined and classified the social sciences, which he called "New Science" [11] (p. 116). This 17th-century misunderstanding of science was compensated by Vico and the importance of social sciences was revealed. Although the working methods of science and social sciences are different from each other, the fields they are interested in are human and human-related issues. For this reason, it is not possible for the paradigm developed on a phenomenon to be independent from these two fields. The findings of the sciences have been reflected in the disciplines of philosophy, sociology, folklore and psychology in the social sciences. In this sense, the metaverse, the great explosion of our age, which is accepted as a technological development in the field of science, will have wide repercussions in the social sciences. Let us consider this prediction in the context of the relationship between quantum physics, which is the subject of physics, and social

sciences.

# 2. Metaverse in the Context of the Expansions of Findings in Science in Social Sciences

### 2.1. The relationship between quantum physics and movements of thought in social sciences

Criticisms of the metaverse claim that the metaverse is a limitation on human free will. When the new findings obtained through quantum physics studies are examined in the social sciences, it is seen that quantum physics is handled in a broad perspective on free will. Sartre points to the changes that quantum physics has made on human perception at the point of perceiving the world in existential philosophy. The building block of the philosophy is the principle that "existence precedes essence". The uncertainty principle of quantum physics is thought to be effective on this principle of Sartre. In explaining his philosophy, Sartre makes room for free will by adopting an indeterminist approach. In this sense, the Copenhagen interpretation points to the existence of objective probabilities in the human brain and the material universe but never denies the existence of free will. In addition, the human element is brought to the forefront in the uncertainty principle and emphasizes that quantum mechanics gains meaning according to the human factor [12] (p. 172–173). The principle of accepting the existence of probabilities in the Copenhagen interpretation of quantum theory is also included in Sartre's philosophy of existentialism as the acceptance of the existence of human free will.

### 2.2. The relationship between quantum physics' double slit experiment, Schrödinger's cat thought experiment and social sciences

In the context of the double-slit experiment and Schrödinger's cat thought experiment conducted within the scope of quantum mechanics, the indeterminacy principle of the quantum world is discussed in the context of free will in social sciences. Thus, a two-dimensional debate emerges. The first dimension of the debate is on the idea that there is no God who created the universe. In such a situation where there is no God, nature acts in two ways within its own functioning. This movement of nature may or may not depend on causality. The second aspect of the debate is based on the idea that there is a God who created the universe. In the case of God's existence, God has surrounded the universe with laws. In this case, causality must be at certain levels. However, in such a gradual causality, one cannot speak of the existence of human free will [13] (p. 114).

## 2.3. The relationship between the super determinism interpretation of quantum physics and social sciences

When we look at the implications of the findings of science in social sciences in the context of the super-determinism interpretation of quantum physics, it is seen that free will is handled with two different views. According to the theory of superdeterminism, the behavior models of subatomic particles that were together before the Big Bang are recorded in themselves. Therefore, they behave in the same way even though they are in separate places after the explosion. From this point of view, it can be concluded that human beings, who are composed of atoms, also act according to the information previously stored in their minds and that they cannot make their decisions of their own free will. In this case, two questions arise: "Does the human being act according to an absolute will when he thinks he is making decisions with his free will? and "Is free will actually an absolute will?" In superdeterminism, there is a macro- and micro-universe. These universe designs remind me of the Turkish Sufi philosophy's proposition that "Whatever is in the universe is in man". The idea of entangled subatomic particles coincides with the idea that God gives each human being an essence of his or her own essence and that all human beings are a part of God. The interrelationship of subatomic particles confirms the saying "If a butterfly flaps its wings in the ocean, there is a storm at the poles". While the production of thought in the social sciences continues in line with these two different views, Stephan Hawking has the final point on the debate in the following words: The body and brain are made of physical matter, the mind is the ever-changing state of this matter. Our bodies are hardware, our minds are software" [14].

# 2.4. The relationship between the parallel/multiverse theory of quantum physics and social sciences

When we look at the implications of the findings of the sciences in the social sciences through the Parallel Universes Theory, in which Hugh Everett claims that the universe itself and everything in it is a wave function, it is seen that the social sciences approach the theory in terms of how we live our lives. The universe that individuals are currently in is a universe in which one of the possibilities in question is realized and the other is not, in line with the decisions they make, just like the results of the double-slit experiment, which change depending on when the observer looks at the experiment and when the observer does not, or the situation of the cat in Schrödinger's cat experiment, which continues to live or die when the observer does not look at the box. I explain with the phrase "this or that, not this or that, but each possibility exists in the same time frame." With each measurement or decision, another parallel universe is created. Every possibility exists at the same time and the individual who makes the decision only exists in one of these universes. The individual is perceived as realized in the universe where his/her singular possibility exists. Parallel universes have also been the subject of science fiction novels and movies in the social sciences. Among the most famous of these movies are "The Butterfly Effect (2004), Dejavu (2006), Moment of Storm (2018) and The Matrix (1999)".

When these theories are considered in the science fiction genre, they open the doors of another world to humanity. In real life, both Everett's theory of parallel universes and superdeterminism exhibit a contradictory structure. When we look at Everett's theory of parallel universes; while the existence in the current universe is maintained with a decision taken with free will, a new parallel universe is created with a decision not taken, a new life created. One of the criticisms of the metaverse is that decisions are made with free will. In this case, it does not matter whether the decision is made with or without free will. As a matter of fact, a new life is created in a new universe in all kinds of possibilities. In this way, a complex situation emerges. The metaverse, the way of life of the super information society, can be interpreted differently from a folkloric perspective. Namely; the

discussions on the existence of multiple universes have stimulated the human imagination. Human beings, who have the ability to create, have formed the basis of the metaverse with the inter-object internet. The idea of the existence of multiple universes is very attractive, but it is difficult and time-consuming to find out whether these universes are real or not. As soon as humans realized this, they thought that they could experience this experience with augmented reality in brand-new universes that they would create themselves without waiting for a long time. This is the roadmap of the metaverse.

#### 2.5. The relationship between quantum physics and new age movements

The positive changes made by quantum physics are seen in quantum computers, artificial intelligence, augmented reality, smartphones, and many modern engineering productions. However, today, a philosophy "quantum philosophy" has been created in which quantum concepts are used even though they have nothing to do with quantum physics. In this movement, which is in the category of new age beliefs, it is thought that there is a consciousness in the structure of the universe. This consciousness is called "cosmic consciousness". Man is a "microcosm". It is claimed that he can activate the "macro universe" with his power of thought. This understanding is called "quantum philosophy". The power of thought is called "quantum thought technique". Representatives of this philosophy are called "spiritual life coaches". They say that they clean the subconscious with this technique. These views in many ways in the fields of art, cinema, music, social media; alternative medicine, healing with energies, therapy programs.

As a result of my examination of quantum physics, thought currents, the double-slit experiment, Schrödinger's cat thought experiment, the interpretation of superdeterminism, the theory of parallel universes and the impact of quantum physics on new age movements in order to exemplify the effects of the findings of science on social sciences, I think that the metaverse should not be viewed only as mathematical information with numerical data. This idea would lead humanity back to its 17th-century delusion.

#### 3. Relationship between folklore, folklorist and metaverse

Commercial activities in the metaverse are characterized by the aim of sustaining consumption under all circumstances. In this part of the study, let us look at the metaverse from the perspective of our field. But are there no cultural activities in the metaverse? While introducing the metaverse, in addition to its commercial dimension, cultural opportunities, concerts and exhibitions were introduced, and different cultural and artistic activities were exemplified. Since it is organized as a platform with the opportunity to address millions of people, it is informed that cultural and artistic activities will gradually increase and events will be organized worldwide. Folklore is a discipline that aims to recognize a society by examining its traditions, customs, traditions and social norms) [15] (p. 15). For this reason, social changes will occur depending on the metaverse and technology. At the end of these changes, some professions will disappear and new professions will emerge. At this stage, folklorists are needed to examine this whole social structure, to identify people's desires and

interests, to determine the hierarchy of needs and to reveal the tendencies of avatars in the metaverse.

The world is currently exploring the impact of digital technologies on the future workforce and occupations. Due to digital transformation [16], it is stated that a new phenomenon called technology unemployment will be encountered, but the issue of how to combat this phenomenon is not much concerned. Looking at the research [17] it is predicted that the jobs of blue-collar workers will disappear due to the transfer of their jobs to robots, and white-collar workers will also face this problem over time. Those who are more optimistic [18] say that new professions will emerge instead of the professions eliminated by technology, and that there will be an increase in areas such as software, hardware and machine maintenance.

Both the world and the professions themselves need to be prepared for this change that professions will experience. In the future, professions will not be dominated by a single field because all professions will be intertwined with the digital world. Professionals will read data related to their fields, solve problems and renew their systems. The qualities that we choose with our cell phones and that define us are all digital data. These data are collected in big data, analyzed and classified with artificial intelligence. Companies utilize this data for sales success. In the future digital world metaverse, it will not be enough for these data to be just numerical expressions and analyzed by artificial intelligence. Because in the multiverse, each data point will point to a social, political, economic and cultural infrastructure. Social science experts will be needed to read and evaluate them. Here, priority will be given to folklore and folklorists who cover all social sciences with a holistic approach. Each culture reveals a cultural prototype structured in line with its own ethical codes. Folklorists are the ones who will identify this cultural prototype. Let's show this with an example. For example, let's assume that 3500 red-colored blouses were sold worldwide in a month and 2000 of these 3500 blouses were purchased by internet users in Turkey. Artificial intelligence will mathematically evaluate this data and make a data/statistics arrangement accordingly. A folklorist, on the other hand, will approach this situation from a different perspective and consider why the color red is preferred in Turkey as a cultural code of information contained in proverbs and idioms such as "The eye of the Turk is red; let it be red for three cents more". It will take into account that red has a different position in the collective subconscious than other colors because it is the color of the Turkish flag. While interpreting the data, they will take all of these factors into consideration and make their comments accordingly. Based on the knowledge that cultural codes are effective in the preferences of societies, the objects they can buy or the subjects they may be interested in can be determined. By examining what societies prefer, it will be possible to have information about what they may prefer. In the metaverse, there will be no need for avatars to declare which cultural prototype they are because folklorists will be able to interpret what is preferred with the data reading technique and make an opinion on what will be preferred in the cultural metaverse. At this point, each nation should have its own technology to design its own cultural metaverse. Science is needed to develop this technology, and social sciences are needed to investigate the effects of this technology and to determine the way forward according to these effects. Folklore will be one of the important professions in both

Society 5.0 and Society 6.0, so the skills that a folklorist should have will be of great importance.

### 4. Metaverse occupations of folklorists

I have already mentioned that almost every technological development in the sciences, every theory put forward has an opening in the social sciences; almost every technological discovery reached through the sciences has consequences that fall within the research field of the social sciences, so it is not the case that the metaverse is beneficial or harmful only in the field of science. This applies to the social sciences as well. A whole new world is about to open up for folklorists. Everyone will take their place in this new world according to their own creativity and vision. At this point, folklorists should establish Culture Metaverse. It is possible for all countries in the world to establish a cultural metaverse and promote their own culture, mythology, history and art. Turkish folklorists can also establish the Turkish Culture Metaverse. In this way, they can introduce their own cultural universe in the metaverse. To the extent that they are successful in this virtual world, economic gain will be possible. Folklorists can turn all the articles they have seen as titles in textbooks into a profession.

I have identified 440 professions that folklorists can do in the metaverse. I have named these professions to perform three different actions as follows: Augmented Reality Designer Folklorist; Augmented Reality Experience Builder Folklorist, Augmented Reality Future Writer Folklorist [19] (p. 132).

The system I will use in the Metaverse I designed is a two-component system with two general headings: a cultural content management system and a user management system [8] (p. 234).

The culture content management system creates content, reflects the user's avatar to the culture content that is relevant to the user's searches, and becomes the realizer of the application in the experience that the user will have. In the metaverse to be prepared by the folklorist, the cultural content management system fulfills two professions. The first is to design the metaverse universe, and the second is to act as an experiencer in the experiences to be lived in this universe because avatars are represented as real people in augmented reality and all their movements are perceived as real. Therefore, there is a need for avatars to act as experiencers in the designs you create. The number of experiencer avatars will vary according to the professional activity you are preparing, because it is unthinkable that the number of experiencer avatars to be used in a concert will be the same as the number of experiencer avatars to be used in large migrations, plateau/winter migrations or caravan activities.

In the user management system; the user avatar manages his/her own records and searches. In the metaverse to be prepared by the folklorist, the user management system is to receive the data (searches/selections) of the user avatars, to read and classify them, in other words, to do data analysis/data reading.

When we bring them together in outline, we can talk about three different professions as Designer Folklorist, Experience Builder Folklorist and Data Analyzer Folklorist. Accordingly, the profession of Augmented Reality Metaverse Designer is the design of a metaverse, the preparation of its content, and the realization of cultural

production.

The profession of Augmented Reality Experience Builder is to organize and supervise the process of access to the cultural content/metaverse and the experience process of the avatars who are guests in the metaverse, and to guide the avatars in creating experiences.

The profession of Augmented Reality Futurist is the Data Analyzer Folklorist analyzing the records of user avatars. It is the reading of the data obtained according to the results of the lived experiences, identifying the functional/non-functional aspects in the metaverse.

We can think of metaverse creation as the preparation of a web page, but a web page is quite simple because you are expected to create universe content, to design a universe, to create a universe! This is why the metaverse is often described as "the deification of man". This universe is a limitless universe that will be shaped only by your power of creation. You need to design and plan what avatars will do in this universe, and create interesting platforms that they will find attractive to experience. As in this example that the world has started to implement, folklorists can also come together and establish cultural metaverses, Folklore Villages, Folklore Universes, build their metahuts (digital dwellings) in these villages/universes, create a sustainable life here, and personalize their digital dwellings according to their own lifestyles and turn them into spaces where they can interact with their target audiences, offer NFTs, share their designs, and collaborate. For this to happen, folklorists need to have a vision. For this reason, I have prepared the 21st Century Folklorist's Skills table (Table 1). Those who have a vision in this great digital explosion will achieve success. The table is as follows.

Table 1. 21st Century Folklorist's Skills

Technical skills	Methodological skills	Social skills	Individual capabilities
Communication technology dominance	Culture ergonomics dominance	Cultures between ability	Flexibility and adaptability
Information technology mastery	Creative thinking	Knowledge ability to transfer	Social capacity
Information technology security mastery	Critical thinking	Language ability	Social skills
Social technology dominance	Reflective thinking	Communication skills	Personal development
Information literacy	Analytical thinking	Team ability to work	Self-management
Media literacy	Entrepreneurial thinking		Tolerance
Working with interdisciplinarity	Free thought		Leadership
Working with multidisciplinary	Making arguments		Productivity
Working with cross-disciplinarity	Problem solving		Ability to motivate learning
Working with transdisciplinarity	Conflict resolution		Ability to work under pressure
Working with indiscipline	Decision making		
Data collection capability	Cooperation		
Data analysis capability	Research capability		
Process management	Using time and social relationships correctly		

There are some studies on the professions I have named "Augmented Reality

Monographic Universe Designer Folklorist and Experience Builder Folklorist and Augmented Reality Story Universe Designer Folklorist and Augmented Reality Storyteller Folklorist," which I consider to be the professions of folklorists.

In the transmission of common culture, augmented reality applications appear in different applications in educational processes. For example [20] (p. 177) transmedia storytelling techniques and game elements are used with augmented reality in children's books and various media. The micro-history of the Skaraborg Region in Sweden is also told through augmented reality. This example also points out that in the metaverse universe where virtual reality, new areas of collaboration, new learning environments and tools can exist, an educational process that provides a high level of interaction and is free from geographical barriers can be constructed. Gronstedt and Ramos [21] (p. 9) say that augmented reality and virtual reality will revolutionize storytelling [22] (p. 249). These thoughts and practices show how important the "Augmented Reality Story Universe Designer Folklorist and Experience Builder Folklorist; Augmented Reality Storyteller Folklorist and Augmented Reality Turkish World Story Festival Designer Folklorist and Experience Builder Folklorist," which I have included in my list as a profession, will be in the future.

Festival organizing is one of the new professions for folklorists in the metaverse. One of the newly established metaverse is Decentraland. This platform is designed as a decentralized 3D virtual reality platform consisting of 90,601 plots of land. It is overseen by the Decentraland Foundation. Its cryptocurrency is Mana, based on the Ethereum blockchain. Decentraland has brought fashion events to the metaverse. In March 2022, Metaverse Fashion Week was held in Decentraland. The event lasted four days. Special shows, panels, shopping opportunities and after parties were organized. It was open to everyone and completely free of charge with the slogan "Everyone is a VIP here!". Guests attending the fashion week purchased NFT items for their avatars using Mana, the platform's local currency. Inspired by Avenue Montaigne in Paris, Decentraland's Luxury Fashion District is an example of the first high-end shopping experience and diverse events. Famous Pop star Grimes wore a custom dress inspired by Mystique, a fictional character in the X-Men series. Grimes' avatar was dressed by Auroboros, a technology fashion house. Grimes' avatar performed live. Attendees met and took selfies with a virtual version of Sophia, the first humanoid robot, throughout the events [23]. The "Metaverse Festival" organized as a metaverse cultural event in Decentraland gives us clues about the topic. Metaverse Festival is defined as a four-day festival of music, culture and creativity. In the festival where different events are held, there are booths where special items for the metaverse world can be purchased. Three things are required to participate in the festival: A computer, a web browser and a digital wallet [22] (p. 251). These examples show how important the professions that I put on my profession list "such as Augmented Reality Turkish World Festivals Designer Folklorist, Experience Builder and Future Writer Folklorist; Augmented Reality Turkish World Dede Korkut Festival Designer Folklorist, Experience Builder and Future Writer Folklorist; Augmented Reality Turkish World Oguz Kagan Festival Designer Folklorist, Experience Builder and Future Writer Folklorist etc." will be.

It is among the metaverse professions of folklorists to design material culture elements that contain Turkish cultural elements for each festival, NFTs in digital discourse, and to promote and sell these NFT as avatars. NFT of mythological heroes can be designed based on mythology, epic, fairy tales, and legends, which are common oral culture products of the Turkic world. NFT can be designed with items belonging to heroes: Arrows, bows, quivers, swords, knives or animals of heroes—horses, bulls, dogs, birds, etc. Depending on the creative power, many designs can be made. Designing clothes for NFT and digital tailoring of clothes by learning computer technology are separate professions. They are metaverse professions of folklorists. Folklorists will be able to utilize their skills in drawing and tailoring in their new professions.

There are many different events in Decentraland. For example, in the Museum District, you may come across an exhibition event organized by DogeCoin, a cryptocurrency. Metaverse will contribute to strategic communication activities such as strengthening brand value, sales-oriented activities, social responsibility campaigns, fairs, and events [22] (p. 251).

As seen in these examples, "Augmented Reality Traditional Photography Exhibition Designer Folklorist, Experience Builder and Future Writer Folklorist; Augmented Reality Traditional Painting Exhibition Designer Folklorist, Experience Builder and Future Writer Folklorist; Augmented Reality Traditional Museum Designer Folklorist, Experience Builder and Future Writer Folklorist" will be important professions of the metaverse. As I have explained in detail, designing a metaverse is one profession, creating experiences for avatars who come to experience the metaverse is another. For example, a universe is designed by a "universe designer folklorist".

In the designed universe, the folklorist who makes the experience process live by doing/making it live, such as telling/making to tell a story; being a migration manager/accompanying, playing/making to play Karagöz, or doing/making to work as a hardware store is an "experience-forming folklorist".

The third profession is data reading. The folklorist who reads, interprets, analyzes, compares, and relates the data that determines the tendencies of avatars who want to experience old Turkish professions such as quilting, blacksmithing, basketry, copper smithing, calligraphy, and marbling in the culture metaverse, thus making the metaverse more in demand, is the "future writer folklorist".

People's interests and areas of success are different from each other. A folklorist may be very talented in design, another may be talented in human relations, another may be talented in dealing with issues from a technical point of view, in analysis/synthesis. Of course, all of these are folklorists. In this respect, they will ensure that their work is much better and more efficient. Choosing the work, they will do according to their interests will also lead them to success. As I mentioned before, the folklorist can perform all three professions at the same time, depending on their equipment and abilities. We can liken this to a tailor who has established his own workshop; both drawing a dress model, sewing the dress and selling the dress.

Every new technological development, every new idea, every new style requires a change in mindset. It would be beneficial to look at the metaverse in this sense and to follow these initiatives that develop applications. Folklorists need to come together and work interdisciplinarily with computer engineers, software developers, web designers, computer engineers and web designers in order to create and design a

profession for the metaverse to be structured either individually or as part of an institution and to present it as a metaverse. In these groups, folklorists should develop methods by exploring their areas of interest, knowledge and skills, discuss, share and create new concepts. They should follow a social innovation program and gain skills in areas such as multiliteracy, human, nature, culture, art, science, technology, law, finance, entrepreneurship, project management, health, sports according to the conditions of Society 6.0.

In my opinion, if we act within the framework of reason and science, if the information learned so far can be transferred correctly, and if it can be presented to the 3D digital world according to the Turkish cultural ergonomics, the people who will restructure Society 6.0 will be folklorists.

### 5. Metaethical theory of folklore and Dede Korkut code of ethics

In this part of my study, I will try to put forward a Culture Metaverse prototype under the name of Dede Korkut Culture Metaverse. Augmented Reality Dede Korkut Mythological World It is possible to define the ethical philosophy of the Dede Korkut Culture Metaverse, which will be established by the Designer Folklorist and Experience Builder Folklorists, with the Dede Korkut ethical code based on the Dede Korkut Ethical Index I put forward in line with the Folkloristic Metaethical Theory and transfer it to universe concepts.

In my doctoral dissertation titled "Folk Philosophy and Metaethical Analysis of Dede Korkut Stories in the Context of Folklore, I gathered ethical values under three main headings as Moral Traditions, Social Traditions, Religious Traditions" according to the traditions they belong to with the Folkloric Metaethical Theory, which I put forward with the synthesis of folklore and metaethics disciplines, and the "Folkloric Grounding Metaethical Analysis Method" I developed as the examination method of the theory. I made the positive and negative ethical value index of the Book of Dede Korkut. I determined Turkish folk philosophy. In my study, I identified 173 positive and negative ethical values in the Book of Dede Korkut. The number of contexts of ethical values is 944. Under the title of "Folk Philosophy in Dede Korkut", I handled each ethical value as a separate item and grounded it with folk ideas together with their contexts. My study will be useful in terms of seeing ethical values and their contexts together in the universe concepts to be designed in the metaverse [24] (p. 1-814) and (p. 814-1771).

#### 5.1. Metaethical theory of folklore

I divide the Metaethical theory of Folklore into three parts: Conceptual roof elements, conceptual structure elements, and basic elements of the conceptual structure elements of the Folkloric Metaethical Theory. The conceptual roof elements of the theory are folk ideas, folk philosophy, and interdisciplinarity. Özkul Çobanoğlu defines folk philosophy as a socio-cultural order, a mental, metaphysical system, and states that Dundes [25] quoting Alan Dundes, states that the core units of folk philosophy are folk ideas. Claude Lévi-Strauss [26] on the other hand, defines the application of stereotypes that come through oral transmission to everyday life as folk philosophy and calls folk philosophy "do-it-yourselfism." These core units pointed out by Dundes and Strauss, folk ideas, come together to form folk philosophy [15] (p. 12–

14).

Folklore is a branch of science that aims to analyze human behavior by examining traditions in order to better understand it [15] (p. 63) morality, as one of the main disciplines of ethics, refers to the set of rules to be followed in social life and is defined as "the theory of general principles". Emerging in the early 20th century as a reaction to normative ethics, metaethics is a system of critical thinking on ethics that aims to justify ethical judgments. The concept of ethics refers to the philosophy of morality and metaethics refers to the philosophy of ethics [27] (p. 18). In this sense, I define morality as "the user's manual of life" and liken "ethical understanding" to an umbrella and consider the handle part of the umbrella as morality, the part that protects the person standing under it when it opens as ethics, and the peak at the top, which is outside the umbrella, as metaethics [24] (p. 15). William Frankena [28] (p. 174) and W. Paul Taylor [29] (p. 12) have reduced all metaethical questions to two questions that metaethical discussions seek solutions to: Can ethical judgments or value judgments be justified? If they can be justified, what can they be justified by? Folkloristic Metaethical Theory answers this question.

The proposition of the Metaethical theory of folklore is "Moral life can be based on social norms." Folklore grounds folk philosophy with folk ideas and metaethics with the propositions it creates. Folkloristic Metaethical Theory combines these two fields with interdisciplinarity and reveals folk philosophy. The theory is an interdisciplinary theory in the fields of folklore and metaethics in order to investigate the ethical aspects of folkloric phenomena and events and to reveal folk philosophy. With the oral/non-verbal cultural, written/material cultural and ritual/behavioral cultural classifications I made for folklore products, it enables the ethical understanding and folk philosophy in folklore products to be revealed. Social sciences need grounding just like science. Where an ethical philosophy comes from, how it was formed, the stages of coming to the present day—that is, the metaethics that philosophizes ethics—need to be grounded. This grounding should be done within a system. Here, the Metaethical Theory of Folklore is the name of this system, in other words, it is the theory that enables the ethical understanding of the folk ideas in ethical values, which is one of its cornerstones, to be revealed and the folk philosophy to be grounded [24] (p. 1-814 and p. 814-1771).

#### 5.2. Metaethical analysis method of folkloristic grounding

I have developed a working method for the Folkloric Metaethical Theory, this method is called the Folkloric Grounding Metaethical Analysis Method. I divide folklore events and phenomena into two as idea-based and action-based. Those that depend on text are idea-based events/phenomena; those that depend on action are folklore products containing action-based events/phenomena. Accordingly, my method proceeds in three stages;

- (1) A tabular listing of ethical action in the folkloric sense/moral phenomena in the metaethical sense in idea-based and action-based structures.
- (2) Identifying folk ideas in the folkloristic sense/metaethical propositions in the metaethical sense according to contexts and grounding ethical values in the folkloristic sense/moral vocabulary in the metaethical sense.

(3) Folk ideas in the folkloric sense/folk philosophy with propositions in the metaethical sense.

It determines the place of ethical actions/ethical values in folk philosophy through three stages.

### 5.3. Epic of Dede Korkut

In Turkish culture, ethical values, especially the ethical value of justice, the ethical value of hospitality, the ethical value of respect for elders and love for minors, are of great importance. Ethical values are very important in written culture as well as in oral culture. Ethical values are included in almost all ancient books on Turkish culture. It is possible to list Yusuf Has Hacip's Kutadgu Bilig (Knowledge of Being Blessed), Edip Ahmet Yüknekî's Atabet'ül Hakayık (Threshold of Truths), Ahmet Yesevî's Divan'ı Hikmet (Hikmetler), as well as many other important works. One of the genres that provide the transmission of values in oral culture is epics.

The Dede Korkut Epic/Dede Korkut Stories or Dede Korkut Book is an epic that conveys values through stories and the heroes of the stories. The Book of Dede Korkut is an epic of 12 stories in which the lives, historical events, nomadic lives, civilizations and cultures of Oghuz Turks between the 7th and 10th centuries are told from the language of the most respected person of the society, the bard Dede Korkut. The epic was written down in the 15th century. There are two copies of the Book of Dede Korkut, the Vatican and Dresden copies. The copies took their names according to their locations. There are twelve epic texts in the Dresden copy and six in the Vatican copy. Recently, the 13th copy of the Dede Korkut Epic, the Turkmen-Sahra copy, was found. The name of the 13th Boyun is Salur Kazan's Killing of the Seven-Headed Dragon (For detailed information on this issue, see [30].

The stories take place in a wide geography from Turkestan to Anatolia, from Mardin, Diyarbakır, Erzurum, Bayburt and Trabzon to Ahıska, Ganja and Demirkapı, which we call the Eastern Anatolia and Azerbaijan region. The stories deal with the struggles of the Oghuz against their enemies and between tribes, bravery, heroism, family unity, love of humans and nature, and love. The Book of Dede Korkut is a very important source for Turkish culture. In the design of the Dede Korkut Culture Metaverse, I preferred to study the Book of Dede Korkut because the content of the epic about the Oghuz Turks is very rich, ethically functional, and has a universal ethical understanding woven with universal ethical values. The names of the stories according to their order in the Book of Dede Korkut are as follows:

- Dirse Han Oğlu Boğaç Han Boyu.
- Salur Kazan'ın Evinin Yağmalandığı Boyu.
- Kam Püre Bey Oğlu Bamsı Beyrek Boyu.
- Kazan Bey Oğlu Uruz Bey'in Tutsak Olduğu Boyu.
- Duha Koca Oğlu Deli Dumrul Boyu.
- Kanlı Koca Oğlu Kanturalı Boyu
- Kazılık Koca Oğlu Yigenek Boyu.
- Basat'ın Tepegöz'ü Öldürdüğü Boyu.
- Begil Oğlu Emren Boyu.
- Uşun Koca Oğlu Segrek Boyu.

- Salur Kazanın Tutsak Olup Oğlu Uruz'un Çıkardığı Boyu.
- İç Oğuz'a Dış Oğuz Asi Olup Beyrek'in Öldüğü Boyu.

#### 5.4. Dede Korkut code of ethics

I have classified the ethical philosophy of Dede Korkut under three main headings and applied it to the metaverse to be established. Each heading is fed with molecular ethical values within itself. In the Dede Korkut Epic, how a society should be and how it should solve its problems are described through stories. As a result of my research, I classified the structure of Oghuz society as a just state structure, egalitarian social order, and free religious life, and the tradition of Alplik. The metaverse application of the Dede Korkut ethical code (for detailed information on this issue, which I have classified [31], shows the following distribution.

Just state structure: Created with the values of justice, equality, and tolerance, the just state structure reflects the ethics of both the founder of the metaverse and the ethics of the metaverse, and every core principle that has been put into the metaverse is included in this code.

Egalitarian social order and free religious life: Created with the values of Mutual Love, Mutual Respect, Respect for Rights, Egalitarian Social Order and Free Religious Life define the life provided to avatars as a metaverse and the human relationships between avatars.

Alplik tradition: The Tradition of Allegiance, created with the values of Decency, Truthfulness, Honesty, can be evaluated in two aspects: the ethical actions of folklorist avatars who create experiences in the metaverse and the ethical actions of user avatars who will create experiences in the metaverse. It defines the general behavior pattern of metaverse employees, the way they approach user avatars and the expected behavior of user avatars. Man's effort to give meaning to himself and his life corresponds to the moment when he meets the universe of thought that exists in his essence and takes action to reflect the contents of this universe to the beings around him. Since the philosophers of the First Age, the purpose of human life and the nature of a virtuous life have been questioned. The emergence of ethics roughly coincides with the fifth century BC. The reason for the emergence of ethics, which we call a sub-branch or discipline of philosophy, is that philosophers such as Socrates and Plato began to think about the purpose of human life and the nature of a virtuous life. At this point, the ethical thinker tended to make sense of hundreds of different phenomena of moral life through a holistic theory. Socrates and Plato made great efforts to demonstrate and justify the existence of universal ethical values and even the existence of a universal ethical understanding [32] (p. 25). Since the metaverse of culture will be a metaverse that opens to the whole world at the stage of placing ethical codes in the universe complexes to be created in the metaverse with cultural content, it is possible to address the whole of humanity through the ethical codes created with the universal ethical values of the Book of Dede Korkut [33] (p. 945–950).

In this context, all countries have an ethical understanding within the framework of their own mythological substructures, historical backgrounds, customs, and traditions, but this ethical understanding expresses the same ethical values for all humanity within the framework of generally valid fixed ethical values. It is important

to remember that the metaverse is a place where the human race will be researched for centuries to come. Just as we learn about prehistoric times from archaeological remains and hieroglyphs, the mega-human digital human will learn about its past from the metaverse. Just as historical artifacts in the world today are protected by UNESCO under the name of world heritage, one day the oldest metaverse in the metaverse will be protected by the international organizations of the next centuries. For this reason, the footprints that humanity will leave in the digital world are of great importance. In this context, the metaverse to be established will be shaped within the framework of the ethical understanding of its founders and will form the metaethicsverse of the metaverse. In this context, augmented reality Dede Korkut Mythological World Designer Folklorist, Experience Builder Folklorist, Future Writer Folklorist, within the scope of the Dede Korkut Culture Metaverse, the metaethicsverse to be structured with the use of the Dede Korkut ethical code will bring a new perspective to the ethical understanding of the digital world. Folklorists who will establish the Dede Korkut Culture Metaverse can benefit from the Dede Korkut ethical index [24] (p. 1-814) and (p. 814-1771) which I have worked with the Folkloristic Metaethical Theory, when defining their metaverse, their ethical philosophy, that is, their "metaethicalverse" in my conceptualization, and define their universe concepts with the Dede Korkut Code of Ethics because Dede Korkut ethics is an ethics that can be carried to the universe. At this point, where I address the issue in terms of ethical philosophy, the metaverse expresses the ethical understanding of its founders. In the context of the Folkloric Metaethical Theory, a "value-oriented" metaethicsverse can be structured in contrast to the general perspective of our age, "consumption-oriented, value-oriented" ethics.

#### 5.5. What is the metaethicsverse

Let us remember that almost every technological development in the sciences has an opening in the social sciences, and almost every technological finding in the sciences has consequences that fall within the research field of the social sciences. This situation is inevitable because human beings are a whole with both their physical emotional structure. It is not possible to think of a science independent of the social sciences and a social science independent of the sciences. Heidegger [34] (p. 34) argues that technological developments have distanced human beings from their existential roots, and in this respect, the dominance of technology over human beings should be questioned. At this point, the Digital Big Bang that humanity will experience: Metaverse is actually similar to John Hick's theory of soul-making. Hick [35] states that the human being is a creature that has not completed its evolution and that the universe offers him the opportunity to evolve and perfect himself. stages humanity has gone through confirm Hick's determination [24] (p. 1347).

In our age, humanity is experiencing the chaos of having lost its ethical values. Philosophers of the First Age saw human beings as a part of nature. The Age of Enlightenment moved away from this idea. With Descartes' mechanistic worldview and Bacon's view of man as the center of the universe, it was claimed that the universe was at the service of man. Thus, man began to consume natural resources rapidly. It has disturbed the balance. As a result of this plunder, today we are faced with many problems that disrupt the ecological balance such as climate change, radioactive

pollution, industrial wastes, environmental pollution, genetically modified organisms, unplanned urbanization. These negative actions have laid the foundations of the Society 6.0 Ecological Revolution Super Information Society. Humanity is resorting to ancient knowledge to solve these problems. It has turned to Traditional Ecological Knowledge (TOK) to solve environmental problems and to ancient ethical knowledge to solve social problems. I believe that it will be possible to bring a solution to the chaos experienced with the ethical philosophy "metaethicsverse" to be applied to the metaverse in line with the Metaethical Theory of Folklore I put forward in order to regain this lost ethical philosophy. There is a universal language reached through the mutual interaction of technology and human beings. This new language is the source of the emergence of a new understanding of ethics. The digital ethics of today's technology, although new, is not an understanding of ethics independent of the ancient wisdom of humanity. Of course, technology changes the way of life of the age to which it belongs, but the folk philosophies of societies do not suddenly change as if a magic wand had touched them. In this context, I define the Metaethicsverse as follows.

Metaethicsverse is the name I give to the comprehensive and holistic Turkish ethical philosophy structured with the Dede Korkut ethical code with the components of Turkish cultural ergonomics in the context of Metaethical theory of Folklore in the Turkish cultural metaverse to be established by Turkish folklorists. The ethical philosophy I mean by metaethicalverse is not the restrictions/ethical prohibitions imposed on avatars in metaverse. The Turkish cultural metaverse already expresses an ethical philosophy, an ethical understanding, an ethical code by being a cultural universe. At this point, the fact that the metaverse to be established by Turkish folklorists is a metaverse with cultural content will provide an advantage in the adoption of ethical understanding, the placement of ethical codes, and the presentation of a metaethical universe. For this reason, the mission of folklorists in the metaverse is to create the ethical plane of this digitalization.

### 6. Defining metaethicsverse with Dede Korkut code of ethics to Dede Korkut culture metaverse

The metaethicsverse structured by the Dede Korkut Code of Ethics will be defined by the Augmented Reality Dede Korkut Mythological World Designer Folklorist and the Experience Builder Folklorist for the Turkish Culture Metaverse. In the Dede Korkut Culture Metaverse I designed, all the ethical values in the 12 stories in the Book of Dede Korkut can be processed together, or an ethical value can be selected and the contexts in which that ethical value takes place in the 12 stories can be processed. The aim of all these design forms is to reveal the philosophy of ethics, that is, the metaethical verse. Three different methods can be applied in metaverse concepts. These three methods are presented to avatars. As a result of their choice, avatars can choose which concept they want to experience in the Dede Korkut Culture Metaverse.

1) Method: The period of Dede Korkut is between the 7th and 10th centuries. In this period, Turks are nomadic. They have obas. They live in tents. They are engaged in animal husbandry. The metaverse is designed as an Oghuz oba. An excursion will be organized and the guest avatars will be shown around the Oghuz yurt under the

supervision of the guide avatar. The trip plan will be organized according to the narration of 12 stories. The stories are told one by one by the guide avatar during the tour. It will be possible to see the geography of the oba, lifestyles, tent life, oba life, to be informed about the jobs and professions done at that time, to experience the food and clothes worn at that time. Thus, avatars will have a pleasant experience.

- 2) Method: In the Dede Korkut Epic, the epic is narrated by the bard Dede Korkut to Bayındır Khan, the Khan of the Oghuz. The narration takes place at night, around a fire lit in the center of the khan, accompanied by the kopuz played by Dede Korkut. This concept can be carried into the metaverse. As in the Book of Dede Korkut, the stories are told by the avatar of the bard Dede Korkut to the guest avatars at night, around a fire in the center of the yurt.
- 3) Method: Each of the 12 stories in the Dede Korkut Epic is about the experiences of a protagonist. The stories can be scripted. They are announced to the avatars in advance, roles are chosen and the stories are staged as a theater play or dramatized with the narration of several avatars. Avatars are free to choose the roles they want. Scripting and dramatizing the stories is the best way to convey ethical values. While writing these scenarios, the Folkloric Grounding Metaethical Analysis Method and the study of revealing ethical values are utilized. In this part of my study, how to define the positive ethical value of being healthy in the metaverse will be exemplified.

## 6.1. Defining the ethical value of being healthy in Turkish Culture Metaverse as metaethical verse with Dede Korkut code of ethics

One of the ethical values that you can carry to the universe is health. Oghuzs think that individual health forms the basis of social health and organize their social lives accordingly. Oghuz society addressed the ethical value of health in both individual and social aspects. They gave importance to both the mental and physical health of the members of the society. Oghuzs have the philosophy of feeding the hungry, clothing the naked, and freeing the debtor from his debt. This philosophy aims to protect the mental and physical health of individuals. It is out of the question for a hungry, naked, or indebted person to remain healthy both physically and spiritually. A person struggling to survive in such difficulties will lose both physical and mental health and will soon become a person who is harmful to society. A person who is physically ill will also require care. For the Oghuz, who lived a nomadic, horse-drawn, and nomadic life in the steppe, the care of a sick person is not easy. For this reason, Oghuzs made efforts to cure diseases immediately and to prevent them from lasting for a long time, and they developed various treatment methods. Oghuz society has put forward the philosophy that it needs to take its place in the steppe as a strong society and to ensure its continuity. They fed the hungry, clothed the naked, and freed the indebted from their debts. Thus, it realized both physical and mental health. He raised healthy generations. The saying of Mustafa Kemal Atatürk, the founder of our country, our great leader, that a sound head is found in a sound body, also points to the important place of this ideology of the Oghuzs in the Turkish worldview. In Dede Korkut Tales, the issue of health is seen in four contexts. The first number of the numbers in the Folkloric Grounding Metaethical Analysis Table (Table 2) of the Positive Ethical Value of Being Healthy below refers to the order of the story in the Book of Dede Korkut; the second number refers to the moral phenomenon order of the stories themselves.

The positive ethical value of being healthy:

#### **Table 2.** Folkloric grounding metaethical analysis table.

1.41. Ethical action in folkloric sense/moral phenomenon in metaethical sense: In order for Boğaç Khan's wound to heal and regain his health, Hz. Hızır enters his dream and his mother heals Boğaç Khan's wound by making the ointment described by Hızır.

Context: "My mother, do not cry, there is no death for me from this wound. Don't be afraid, the gray horseman Hızır came into my dream. He touched my wound three times. He said there is no death for you from this wound. Mix mountain flower and mother's milk and make ointment. Rub the ointment on your wound. You will be healed. You will recover" [36] (p. 19).

Folk ideas of ethical action in the folkloristic sense/propositions in the metaethical sense:

- 1. A healthy individual means a healthy society and healthy generations.
- 2. Health is of great importance for the survival of societies.
- 3. In Oghuz society, it is important for individuals to be both physically and spiritually healthy.
- 4. Generations must be healthy for the continuity of society.
- 5. Healthy generations bring social success.
- 6. A sound head is found in a sound body.
- 2.15. Ethical action in the folkloric sense/moral phenomenon in the metaethical sense: Karachuk Shepherd healing his wounds, treating himself to regain his health.

Bağlam: "Karaçuk Çoban's brothers were martyred. The shepherd was crying a lot. He swore he would avenge his brothers. He passed over the bodies of the enemies. He went and sat under a tree. He had a big wound on his arm. He took some wool from his cap, took out his lighter and lit it. He put the burnt wool on his wound" [36] (p. 24).

Folk ideas of ethical action in the folkloristic sense/propositions in the metaethical sense:

- 1. Healing wounds and restoring the individual to health is of paramount importance.
- 2. The individual is not left injured or sick, but is treated and healed.
- 3.39. Ethical action in the folkloric sense/moral phenomenon in the metaethical sense: Dede Korkut's knowledge of the harm of fleas to human health and saving Deli Karcar from fleas.

Context: "Deli Karçar's body was covered with fleas. Dede Korkut told him to go immediately and throw himself into the stream. Deli Karçar went running. He threw himself into the stream. The fleas flowed over him. He was saved" [36] (p. 40-41).

Folk ideas of ethical action in the folkloristic sense/propositions in the metaethical sense:

- 1. The importance given to human health brings healthy generations.
- 2. The correct action is shown to the individual who misbehaves, who does wrong.
- 3. After the correct action is demonstrated, efforts are made to restore the individual's health.
- 9.38. Ethical action in the folkloric sense/moral phenomenon in the metaethical sense: Begil wrapping his right thigh to heal his wound and regain his health, giving importance to being healthy.

Context: "Begil had fallen off his horse. His right thigh was broken. He immediately untied his horse from his ankle. He wrapped his foot tightly and then jumped on his horse. He wrapped his foot tightly around his horse's belly again. He stabilized it. He rested his head on his horse's neck. The wise animal brought Begil to his homeland [36] (p. 102).

Folk ideas of ethical action in the folkloristic sense/propositions in the metaethical sense:

- 1. Health is first and foremost.
- 2. Health is the greatest asset.
- 3. "The most precious thing for societies is the existence of their state, a healthy breath is as precious as a state." Suleiman the Magnificent
  - 1.41. The first context is in the story of Boğaç Khan, the son of Dirse Khan. Boğaç Khan is wounded. Hz. Hızır enters his dream and tells him that an ointment made from his mother's milk and mountain flower will cure his wound.
  - 2.15. The second context in The House of Salur Kazan is Looted. Karachuk Shepherd is wounded while fighting enemies. The shepherd takes a piece of wool from his cap, burns it and presses it on his wound. He treats his wound.
  - 3.39. The third context is in the story of Kam Püre Oğlu Bamsı Beyrek. Deli Karçar is attacked by fleas through his own fault. Dede Korkut takes him into the river and saves him from fleas.
    - 9.38. The fourth context is in Begil Oğlu Emren Boyu. Begil falls off his horse.

His thigh bone is broken. Begil harnesses his horse and ties his foot to the horse's belly in a stable way. The animal brings Begil to his lodge.

Episodes are included in the Folkloristic Grounding Metaethical Analysis table. The place of health ethics in folk philosophy is discussed in the context of folk ideas/suggestions. Each of the episodes belongs to a story in a Dede Korkut Epic. It would be an interesting experience for the avatars if all four stories were played by the avatars as a theater play and the ethical actions were experienced by the guest avatars. With this categorization I made in the ethical structure of Dede Korkut, the ethical value of health will be adapted to the modern world through the experiences of avatars and will be an important indicator for universal ethics [37] (p. 535).

The task of folklorists in the structuring of the culture metaverse is to create the ethical plane of digitalization. In the established metaverse, the metaethicsverse, which will be put forward with the Dede Korkut Code of Ethics, will become a functioning ethics over time. In the trial process, the points where the ethical understanding is blocked or continues to function will be determined and improved through the behavior of the avatars. These studies will be worked on, supported by data, and finalized as examples in the international ethical agreements that seem absolutely necessary in the future.

### 6.2. Defining the ethical value of animal love in Turkish Culture Metaverse as metaethical verse with Dede Korkut code of ethics

In the Turkish Culture Metaverse concepts, the avatars in which ethical codes will be expressed can be deployed as fixed avatars. In the Dede Korkut concept, the protagonist Begil in Begil Oğlu Emren Boyu can be exemplified to encode animal love in a universal sense. Begil is a very good hunter. He does not shoot animals with an arrow but catches them with his bow. He examines the animals and if they are weak, unable to hunt, in mating season or pregnant, he releases them by putting a mark on their ears. The name of this sign is Begil's joy. This ethical action expressing love for animals is a very important ethical action. The fact that the Oghuz, who were fed with game meat in accordance with the living conditions of the time, hunted as much as they needed and did not hunt during the mating periods of animals is also an indication of their love for nature. The release of an animal with Begil's joy in its ear in case it is caught by another Oghuz brave is another very important point that reflects the respect of the members of the society for each other and their ethical understanding.

It may be possible to carry this ethical action to our age and universality as follows: Today, after examinations and vaccinations are applied to stray animals, a plastic clip is attached to the ears of the animals. These clips can be called Begil joy. Begil can be designed as a stationary veterinarian avatar within the universe concept, and in the universe design, Begil can be deployed as a veterinarian who examines stray animals and puts Begil joy clips in their ears. Begil, as a stationary avatar, examines the animals with an information note on his head and Begil joyfully clips in their ears after giving them care and vaccinations. The experience-generating folklorist avatar can enable guest avatars in the metaverse to experience wearing the joy of Begil. The experience of wearing Begil's joy to the user avatars, either at the beginning as a fixed veterinary avatar with an information note containing an explanation about his historical identity

or by the experience-forming folklorist avatar, will both express the reaction to hunting and carry the love of animals to the universe [26] (p. 1254).

#### 7. Conclusion

In our study; the big digital explosion: In our study, information about the metaverse was given, its positive and negative aspects were discussed, and based on the fact that almost every technological development in science has an opening in social sciences, the concept of the metaverse was examined under the titles of the double-slit experiment, Schrödinger's cat thought experiment, super-determinism interpretation, parallel/multiple universes theory, and the relationship of new age movements within the scope of quantum physics. Under the title of Folklore, Folklorist and Metaverse relationship, the place of folklore in the digital world has been investigated, the table of skills that folklorists should have has been prepared and the professions that folklorists can do in the metaverse have been revealed. As a new concept, the concepts of cultural ergonomics, cultural ergonomic process, cultural ergonomic structure, social technology and the Dede Korkut ethical code were explained, and a prototype of a culture metaverse called the Dede Korkut culture metaverse was tried to be put forward.

Our study, as the first study to examine the metaverse from a folkloric perspective, aims to address the disciplines of folklore and ethics at the metaethical level and to adapt them to digital universes, to interpret Dede Korkut's ethical philosophy with a universal perspective and to reconstruct it in the metaverse environment, and to draw attention to the new goals to be achieved by folklorists who will undertake the task of quarterbacking the digital age.

What can be done to prevent the addition of new ones to the existing ethical problems in the world has been mentioned and the Metaethicsverse, which expresses the ethical plane of the metaverse to be established, has been introduced. How the metaethicsverse will be defined in the designs of the Dede Korkut Culture Metaverse is expressed with examples from the Book of Dede Korkut. How to define the Metaethicverse in the Dede Korkut Culture Metaverse within the scope of the Dede Korkut Code of Ethics, the Positive Ethical Value of Health and the Positive Ethical Value of Animal Love were exemplified.

Human beings have been engaged in a philosophy of ethics from the moment they appeared on the stage of history. The philosophy of ethics has changed throughout human history with the effects of different forms of society, and today, humanity is faced with the negativity caused by the loss of many values. The metaverse, which is the last point that technology has reached, is a new platform in terms of reminding humanity of the ethical values it has forgotten and creating an ethical understanding compatible with technology. In this sense, all countries of the world should put forward an ethical understanding by making use of their own mythological backgrounds, their own historical substructures, traditions and customs, and strive to carry this ethical understanding to a universal ethical philosophy. The metaethicsverse, which I have put forward in the Dede Korkut code of ethics, can serve as a guiding task in this new online life. Action should be taken to establish a cultural metaverse that can be introduced to metaverse user avatars belonging to different nations of the world and to the whole world through user avatars that multiply over time. In this

context, academia is an important institution to lead this process of change and transformation. I believe that metaverse digital, online life can realize a folkloric metaethical revolution and contribute to the world's achievement of a common, universal ethical understanding. My study is to draw attention to these new goals.

**Conflict of interest:** The author declares no conflict of interest.

#### References

- Nils JN. Artificial Intelligence Past and Future. Istanbul Boğaziçi University Publishing House; 2018.
- 2. Hobbes T. Leviathan. Ankara: Yapı Kredi Publications; 2020.
- 3. Çobanoğlu S. Folklore and Metaverse in the Cradle of New Worlds. Canakkale: Paradigma Academy Publications; 2023.
- 4. Available online: https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/abs/pii/S0262407921014500?via (accessed on 9 August 2025).
- 5. Available online: https://www.goodreads.com/book/show/61240297-snow-crash (accessed on 9 August 2025).
- 6. Available online: https://www.theverge.com/22749919/mark-zuckerberg-facebook-meta-company-rebrand (accessed on 9 August 2025).
- 7. Available online: https://www.theverge.com/22833369/nike-rtfkt-nftsneaker-shoe-metaverse-compa/ (accessed on 9 August 2025).
- 8. Kim JG. A Study on Metaverse Culture Contents Matching Platform. International Journal of Advanced Culture Technology. 2021; 9(3): 232-237.
- 9. Available online: https://www.webtekno.com/influencer- metaverse-metafluence-h119877.html/ (accessed on 9 August 2025).
- Available online: https://www.hurriyet.com.tr/teknoloji/yazarlar/ergi-sener/metaversee-yonelik songelismeler-vemetaverseu-gelistiren-yerli-girisimler-42040914 (accessed on 9 August 2025).
- 11. Freund J. Theories of Human Sciences. Ankara: Turkish Historical Society Publications; 1997. p. 116.
- 12. Durğun S. The Effects of Quantum Theory on Sartre's Existentialism. Kaygı Uludağ University Faculty of Arts and Sciences Journal of Philosophy. 2015; 24: 151-176.
- 13. Şeker ME, Çilingir L. Determinism and Free Will in Gerard't Hooft. Temaşa Journal of Philosophy. 2021; 13: 112-130.
- 14. Available online: https://www.blutv.com/diziler/yabanci/stephen-hawkings-grand-design/1-sezon/1/2 bolum-izle (accessed on 9 August 2025).
- 15. Çobanoğlu Ö. Introduction to Folklore Theories and Research Methods. Ankara: Akçağ Publications; 1999.
- 16. Choi DY, Kang JH. Introduction: The Future of Jobs in an Increasingly Autonomous Economy. Journal of Management Inquiry. 2019; 28(3): 298-299. doi: 10.1177/1056492619827373.
- 17. Eichhorst W. Labor Market Institutions and The Future of Work: Good Jobs for All? IZA Institute of Labor Economics. 2017; (122): 22.
- 18. Pejic-Bach M, Bertoncel T, Meško M, et al. Text Mining Of İndustry 4.0 Job Advertisements. International Journal of Information Management. 2020; 50: 416-431.
- 19. Çobanoglu S. Metaeticverse in the Context of the Relationship of Folk Science and Metaverse. Turcology Research. 2023; 77(1): 126-139. doi: 10.5152/jtri.2023.22182.
- 20. Holloway-Attaway L, Vipsjö L. Using Augmented Reality, Gaming Technologies, and Transmedial Storytelling to Develop and Co-design Local Cultural Heritage Experiences. In: Visual Computing for Cultural Heritage. Springer, Cham; 2020. pp. 177-204.
- 21. Gronstedt A, Ramos M. Learning Through Transmedia Storytelling. Association for Talent Development; 2014.
- 22. 24. Kuş, O. Metaverse: Perceptions of Opportunities and Concerns in the 'Digital Big Bang.' Intermedia International e-Journal. 2021; 8(15): 245-266.
- 23. Available online: https://themetaversefestival.io/MusicFestivalFAQs.pdf (accessed on 9 August 2025).
- 24. Çobanoğlu S. Folk Philosophy and Metaethical Analysis of Dede Korkut Stories in the Context of Folklore [PhD thesis]. Institute of Social Sciences, Department of Turkish Language and Literature, Ankara: Yıldırım Beyazıt University; 2021.
- 25. Dundes A. Folk ideas As Units of Worldview. Toward New Perspectives in Folklore. Austin: The University of Texas Press;

- 1972. pp. 93-103.
- 26. Lévi-Strauss C. Wild Thought. Istanbul: Yapı Kredi Publications; 1994.
- 27. Cevizci A. Introduction to Ethics. Istanbul: Paradigma Publications; 2002.
- 28. Frankena W. Ethics. Ankara: İmge Kitabevi; 2007.
- 29. Taylor WP. The Moral Judgment, Readings in Contemporary Meta-Ethics. New-Jersey: Prentice-Hall, Englewood Cliffs; 1963.
- 30. Çobanoğlu S. Analysis of Dede Korkut 13th Epic "Salur Kazan's Killing of the Seven-Headed Dragon" in the Context of Axel Olrik Epic Laws. Journal of Eurasian International Studies. 2019; 7(19): 81-101.
- 31. Çobanoğlu S. Ethical Codes within the Framework of Cultural Ergonomics in Kazakh Abdal Taşlamalarında with Folkloric Metaethical Theory. Hacettepe University Journal of Turkish Studies. 2022; (37): 143-168.
- 32. Cevizci A. Ethics Moral Philosophy. Ankara: Say Publications; 2015.
- 33. Çobanoğlu S. Cultural Ergonomics and Determinations on the Universality of Dede Korkut Ethics Code. In: International Turkiyat Congress Proceedings Booklet. Çankırı Karatekin University; 2022. pp. 945-960.
- 34. Heidegger M. What Happened in 1933? Der Spiegel's Historical Interview with Heidegger. Ankara: Yapı Kredi Yayınları; 1993.
- 35. Hick J. Evil and The God of Love. London, Macmillan; 1985.
- 36. Ergin M. Dede Korkut Book Text-Dictionary. Istanbul: Ebru Publications; 1986.
- 37. Çobanoğlu S. Health in Folk Culture. (Ed. Prof. Dr. Ömür Ceylan), Dede Korkut Sample of the Positive Ethical Value of Being Healthy in Folk Philosophy within the Framework of Folkloristic Metaethical Theory. Istanbul: Motif Foundation Publications; 2022. pp. 525-538.